

Message

From: Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/3/2020 11:58:20 PM
To: Raymond, Kelley [Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov]
CC: Woods, Andrea [Woods.Andrea@epa.gov]; Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]; DeLuca, Isabel [DeLuca.Isabel@epa.gov]
Subject: Re: technical backups

Please also add Darryl Weatherhead in OAQPS as a technical backup for Thursday's

On Jun 2, 2020, at 7:40 PM, Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov> wrote:

Absolutely!

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 2, 2020, at 6:16 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Please also add Robin Langdon in OAQPS as technical backup for Wednesday's 4pm call and Thursday's 11:30am call. Thanks.

From: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 1:21 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Woods, Andrea <Woods.Andrea@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>; DeLuca, Isabel <DeLuca.Isabel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: technical backups

Thank you Leif! Adding Andrea from OPA who can include that for the Administrator on the materials. I will forward the invites. When you get an additional name from OAQPS please let me know.

Kelley Raymond
 Office of Air and Radiation
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 1:06 PM
To: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: technical backups

Kelley –

You can include Elizabeth Kopits as a technical backup for all the meetings, the one tomorrow at 4pm and then the two calls on Thursday.

You can list me also for the two calls on Thursday.

I'm still waiting to hear back from others in OP and OAQPS about their availability but at least Elizabeth offers great backup.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:54 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thank you Leif! Did you all discuss and decide who should do the technical backup for the various rollout calls on the 3rd and 4th? I've had a couple pings from OCIR and OPA as they would like to include the names in the Administrator's briefing materials.

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 1, 2020, at 8:50 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Kelley – Here is the complete comment response and revised text document that I just sent back to OMB. As I indicated to Elke, we can make ourselves available tomorrow to talk through any parts of our responses and text.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460
 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:35 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) Kopits, Elizabeth
 <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex
 <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document (“...EPA-2”) with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460
| USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif

Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM

To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Kopits, Elizabeth

[<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>](mailto:Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov)

Cc: Conrad, Daniel [<conrad.daniel@epa.gov>](mailto:conrad.daniel@epa.gov); Marten, Alex

[<Marten.Alex@epa.gov>](mailto:Marten.Alex@epa.gov); Lamson, Amy [<Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>](mailto:Lamson.Amy@epa.gov)

Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif [<Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>](mailto:Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov); Kopits, Elizabeth

[<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>](mailto:Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov)

Cc: Conrad, Daniel [<conrad.daniel@epa.gov>](mailto:conrad.daniel@epa.gov); Marten, Alex

<Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>

Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM

To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP); Kopits, Elizabeth

<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex

<Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP

OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)

OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B

1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460

| USA

Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Sent: Thursday, May 20, 2020 7:03 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth

<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L.
EOP/OMB < **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** >
wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and
blue highlights for new comments. New edits are
shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

<2060-AU51 NPRM 06 01 2020 EPA-2.docx>

Message

From: Wolfson, Steve [Wolfson.Steve@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/2/2020 3:45:24 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Griffiths, Charles [Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov]; Dockins, Chris [Dockins.Chris@epa.gov]; Langdon, Robin [Langdon.Robin@epa.gov]; Weatherhead, Darryl [Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov]; Chan, Elizabeth [Chan.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Munis, Ken [Munis.Ken@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Works for me

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:03 AM
To: Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>; Langdon, Robin <Langdon.Robin@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Chan, Elizabeth <Chan.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Munis, Ken <Munis.Ken@epa.gov>; Wolfson, Steve <Wolfson.Steve@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

I am available. How does 3pm work for others?

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:01 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Could you do a staff call at 3 today?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:35 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)> Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document (“...EPA-2”) with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,

Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Fann, Neal [Fann.Neal@epa.gov]
Sent: 5/27/2020 1:00:08 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Weatherhead, Darryl [Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov]; Langdon, Robin [Langdon.Robin@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 2

Will do Leif. Can you (re)send the OneDrive link?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, May 27, 2020 8:58 AM
To: Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Langdon, Robin <Langdon.Robin@epa.gov>; Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 2

FYI if you have a moment to take a look at Elizabeth's OneDrive file with some of the OMB passback comments we received yesterday.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, May 26, 2020 10:10 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>; Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Munis, Ken <Munis.Ken@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 2

Hi All,

I just went through Batch 2 and incorporated all OMB line edits and new comment bubbles into our OneDrive working version of the document. I flagged all of them (except for very minor typos/grammatical edits) with comment bubbles highlighted in LIGHT BLUE so you can easily find them. It is not too much.

We will see what more we get tomorrow re: Batch 1 discussion and Batch 3.

Thanks,
 Elizabeth

From: Kopits, Elizabeth
Sent: Tuesday, May 26, 2020 8:58 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>; Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Munis, Ken <Munis.Ken@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 2

OK, I just talked to Amanda. She said batch 2 is the most manageable so I'm going to try to review that now and then call it a night. She will be working to send us batch 3 tomorrow, and batch 1 is a lot more complicated and will require a call with Margo to guide us through it. She thought that would occur tomorrow as well but didn't know the specific time and who would be included. Will let you know if I hear more.

Thanks,
 Elizabeth

From: Thomas, Amanda L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Tuesday, May 26, 2020 8:47 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 2

Do you want to call me? [REDACTED]

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, May 26, 2020 8:46 PM
To: Thomas, Amanda L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]> Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 2

Hi Amanda,

Quick question – on any old comments, if there was no additional OMB comment/edit on our response bubble, then can we assume those are resolved? I think the only way to get a handle on this is to start deleting comment bubbles that are resolved and accepting changes that have no further comments from either OMB or EPA side.
Does that make sense?

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Thomas, Amanda L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Tuesday, May 26, 2020 8:37 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 2

Please find attached additional comments. We're still working on another batch to be delivered tomorrow. Thank you for your patience. Amanda

Message

From: Dockins, Chris [Dockins.Chris@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/2/2020 3:19:43 PM
To: Weatherhead, Darryl [Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov]; Griffiths, Charles [Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov]; Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
CC: Langdon, Robin [Langdon.Robin@epa.gov]; Chan, Elizabeth [Chan.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Munis, Ken [Munis.Ken@epa.gov]; Wolfson, Steve [Wolfson.Steve@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

3 is fine for me too.

From: Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 02, 2020 11:15 AM
To: Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>; Langdon, Robin <Langdon.Robin@epa.gov>; Chan, Elizabeth <Chan.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Munis, Ken <Munis.Ken@epa.gov>; Wolfson, Steve <Wolfson.Steve@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

I'm available.

From: Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 02, 2020 11:09 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>; Langdon, Robin <Langdon.Robin@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Chan, Elizabeth <Chan.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Munis, Ken <Munis.Ken@epa.gov>; Wolfson, Steve <Wolfson.Steve@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

I have a 3:00 meeting but I can follow up with Elizabeth afterwards.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:04 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>; Langdon, Robin <Langdon.Robin@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Chan, Elizabeth <Chan.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Munis, Ken <Munis.Ken@epa.gov>; Wolfson, Steve <Wolfson.Steve@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

That's fine for me.

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 2, 2020, at 11:03 AM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

I am available. How does 3pm work for others?

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:01 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Could you do a staff call at 3 today?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:35 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document (“...EPA-2”) with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy

<Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/2/2020 3:03:33 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

I'm available.

Amy Lamson
 Policy and Regulatory Analysis Division, Office of Policy
 U.S. EPA
 202-564-3949

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 02, 2020 11:03 AM
To: Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>; Langdon, Robin <Langdon.Robin@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Chan, Elizabeth <Chan.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Munis, Ken <Munis.Ken@epa.gov>; Wolfson, Steve <Wolfson.Steve@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

I am available. How does 3pm work for others?

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:01 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Could you do a staff call at 3 today?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:35 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document ("...EPA-2") with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent

later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)> wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/2/2020 7:25:48 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Great. Thanks!

--

Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 02, 2020 3:25 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Lisa Thompson in OAQPS is a rulewriter and was double-checking the text. I flagged these items for her to see if she already gave them a second look or was out of the document before Alex wrapped up. Thanks.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 3:15 PM
To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Ok. I am also about to open the onedrive version so I will look at these too.

From: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 3:12 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

I went through the reg text on the version Leif sent a link for this morning. I cleaned up a few things which would benefit from a second set of eyes. Four things I will call attention to since it seems to still have anonymized edits/comments on:

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

--

Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 02, 2020 2:22 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

I've spoken with OMB – you should be getting their pass back shortly. They feel it will be sufficient, and a call will not be needed.

Please forward to the broader list from the earlier chain when it comes in, and I'm here if anyone wants to chat it through.

Kelley Raymond
Office of Air and Radiation
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 1:49 PM
To: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Kelley – I am still waiting for an update from OMB on what they wanted to discuss at today's 3pm call. But they were organizing it as a staff-level call.

See Elke's note below about how OIRA might now need to coordinate. I'm not sure if this would change the timing from 3pm.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB { Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 1:42 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Leif, I see your political appointee accepted. If EPA was planning on doing a mixed policy and staff call, I would need to reschedule to include ours as well. Thanks.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:11 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Yes, we can do a staff call at 3pm. Thanks.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:01 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Could you do a staff call at 3 today?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:35 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document (“...EPA-2”) with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM

To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**; Kopits, Elizabeth

<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**

Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>

Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM

To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP

OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)

OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B

1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA

Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)> wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: 4/23/2020 5:40:19 PM
To: Veney, Carla [Veney.Carla@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Tyree, Robin [Tyree.Robin@epa.gov]; Yarbrough, John (Daniel) [Yarbrough.Daniel@epa.gov]; Wheeler, Kevin [Wheeler.Kevin@epa.gov]; McGartland, Al [McGartland.Al@epa.gov]; Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Thanks, Carla. Please hold 3-4pm on WED.

From: Veney, Carla <Veney.Carla@epa.gov>
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 9:48 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Tyree, Robin <Tyree.Robin@epa.gov>; Yarbrough, John (Daniel) <Yarbrough.Daniel@epa.gov>; Wheeler, Kevin <Wheeler.Kevin@epa.gov>; McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Good Morning, Brittany Bolen would like to participate on the call. I can make any time after 3:00 on Wednesday work. Thank you.

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB" <**Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**>
Date: April 22, 2020 at 9:25:07 PM EDT
To: "Hockstad, Leif" <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: "Kopits, Elizabeth" <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>, "Conrad, Daniel" <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

All, DOJ wants to relay comments by phone. These are the times that work for ENRD and OMB. Can you let me know what works for EPA?

Tuesday 1-2 or 4-5 or
 Wednesday after 1

Elke

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 9:15 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Yes, it would be fine to forward these to other reviewers.

Thanks,
Leif

On Apr 21, 2020, at 6:28 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

<[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]> wrote:

Thanks, all. Are you Ok with me circulating the ANPRM comments document to reviewers?

On Apr 21, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Elke –

Please find attached materials for tomorrow's meeting. We have provided an overview of the proposal and also a document with a summary of comments from the ANPRM as you requested.

Thanks,
Leif

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460
| USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

<[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]>

Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 5:46 PM

To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB; Hockstad, Leif; Kopits, Elizabeth;

'Reg Review (USDA)'; Karen.Villatoro@sba.gov; David Rostker; Reg

Review (DOI); OS HHSExecSec; amathew@doc.gov; [osd.mc-](mailto:osd.mc-alex.ocmo.mbx.dod-reg-reviews@mail.mil)

alex.ocmo.mbx.dod-reg-reviews@mail.mil; 'gc-

71energyregs@hq.doe.gov'; eric.t.gormsen@usdoj.gov;

robert.hinchman@usdoj.gov; Stacey Jensen; OIRA;

PeckhamYM@state.gov; DOT.REGULATIONS@dot.gov

Subject: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM

When: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 9:45 AM-10:30 AM (UTC-05:00)

Eastern Time (US & Canada).

Where: [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]

<BC NPRM_1 pager overview for NCEE_short-OAR.docx>
<ANPRM_overview of public comments_OP-vOAR.docx>

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 5/21/2020 9:47:38 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
Subject: RE: call

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
Sent: Thursday, May 21, 2020 5:04 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: call

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Got it. Will send invite later tonight.

On May 21, 2020, at 2:04 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Elke –

Yes, it looks like we have gotten schedules aligned for the staff + policy OMB-EPA call tomorrow, Friday May 22 at 10:30-11:30am. If you could send a calendar invite to formally put it on everyone's calendars and also secure an OMB conference call line, that would be great.

On the EPA side:

OAR – Anne Idsal	6 Personal Privacy (PP)
OAR – Kelley Raymond	
OAR – John Shoaff	
OAR – myself (Hockstad)	
OP – Brittany Bolen	
OP – Kevin Wheeler	
OP – Al McGartland	
OP – Elizabeth Kopits	
OP – Amy Lamson	
OGC – Dan Conrad	

I may include a couple other staff level people from OAR on the call but I need to confirm whether they are working tomorrow.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
Sent: Wednesday, May 20, 2020 9:07 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: call

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

OK, thanks. Let me know if I should send a calendar invite.

On May 20, 2020, at 7:07 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Elke – I think we are going to aim for the 10:30-11:30am timeslot on Friday. I am working with the schedulers but that time seems to be lining up for folks. I will be in touch tomorrow morning to confirm and thanks for finding some time Friday morning.

Thanks,
Leif

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Sent: 4/23/2020 2:26:19 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Sorry about the scheduling and thanks for the flexibility. These large calls are always hard to schedule.

On Apr 23, 2020, at 10:23 AM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Unfortunately I need to be completely out of pocket on Wednesday afternoon. If Elizabeth and Dan are available I think they should be able to cover and especially Dan in talking with DOJ. I can connect with them on Thursday morning to get their notes and feedback on the conversation.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 10:11 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: Fwd: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

leif, can you make that work?

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Veney, Carla" <Veney.Carla@epa.gov>
Date: April 23, 2020 at 9:47:45 AM EDT
To: "Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB" <[REDACTED]>
Cc: "Kopits, Elizabeth" <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>, "Conrad, Daniel" <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>, "Tyree, Robin" <Tyree.Robin@epa.gov>, "Yarbrough, John (Daniel)" <Yarbrough.Daniel@epa.gov>, "Wheeler, Kevin" <Wheeler.Kevin@epa.gov>, "McGartland, Al" <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>, "Hockstad, Leif" <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Good Morning, Brittany Bolen would like to participate on the call. I can make any time after 3:00 on Wednesday work. Thank you.

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB" <[REDACTED]>

Date: April 22, 2020 at 9:25:07 PM EDT
To: "Hockstad, Leif" <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: "Kopits, Elizabeth" <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>, "Conrad, Daniel" <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM

All, DOJ wants to relay comments by phone. These are the times that work for ENRD and OMB. Can you let me know what works for EPA?

Tuesday 1-2 or 4-5 or
Wednesday after 1

Elke

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 9:15 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM

Yes, it would be fine to forward these to other reviewers.

Thanks,
Leif

On Apr 21, 2020, at 6:28 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB { Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) } wrote:

Thanks, all. Are you Ok with me circulating the ANPRM comments document to reviewers?

On Apr 21, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Elke –

Please find attached materials for tomorrow's meeting. We have provided an overview of the proposal and also a document with a summary of comments from the ANPRM as you requested.

Thanks,
Leif

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY
SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT
(OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA
| WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A
| WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L.
EOP/OMB

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 5:46 PM

To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB;
Hockstad, Leif; Kopits, Elizabeth; 'Reg
Review (USDA)';

Karen.Villatoro@sba.gov; David

Rostker; Reg Review (DOI); OS

HHSExecSec; amathew@doc.gov;

osd.mc-alex.ocmo.mbx.dod-reg-

reviews@mail.mil; 'gc-

71energyregs@hq.doe.gov;

eric.t.gormsen@usdoj.gov;

robert.hinchman@usdoj.gov; Stacey

Jensen; OIRA; PeckhamYM@state.gov;

DOT.REGULATIONS@dot.gov

Subject: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing
on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and
Transparency in Considering Benefits
and Costs in the Clean Air Act
Rulemaking Process NPRM

When: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 9:45
AM-10:30 AM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time
(US & Canada).

Where: (Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP))

<BC NPRM_1 pager overview for
NCEE_short-OAR.docx>
<ANPRM_overview of public
comments_OP-vOAR.docx>

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: 6/3/2020 9:26:52 PM
To: Manibusan, Mary [Manibusan.Mary@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]; Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Great. It's open.

From: Manibusan, Mary <Manibusan.Mary@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 5:22 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>; Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Yes, the change was made and all highlights were removed.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 5:21 PM
To: Manibusan, Mary <Manibusan.Mary@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>; Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

OK. There was one number in the reg text that needed to be renumbered. Can you make sure that is fixed before upload? I will open ROCIS momentarily.

Elke

On Jun 3, 2020, at 5:11 PM, Manibusan, Mary <Manibusan.Mary@epa.gov> wrote:

Elke,

Can you please open ROCIS up for amendment? I will let you know when the upload has been completed.

Mary

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 4:59 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>; Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>; Manibusan, Mary <Manibusan.Mary@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Thanks, Elizabeth. OMB concludes review by email. When you're ready to conclude in ROCIS let me know.

On Jun 3, 2020, at 3:58 PM, Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Thanks, Elke. We accepted all the changes. Attached is the clean final version.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.Hodson@epa.gov> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 3:21 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Hi Elizabeth, changes marked with a comment box that says "6/3 1:30pm" and highlighted in green. I'll try to reach you in a minute on one thing.

Elke

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 12:59 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.Hodson@epa.gov> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>;
Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Hi Elke,

Attached is the current draft. Please let us know if there is anything that would still benefit from discussion. Any edits we made on your passback from last night are flagged.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.Hodson@epa.gov> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:09 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

All, please find the passback in the attached.

1. The OMB2 document is clean with new edits tracked. Any new responses are marked with "6/2".
2. The second document has mainly copy edits. The changes are labelled with yellow highlight and "6-2-20".

Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 06 01 2020 EPA-2_060320_344PMCLEAN.docx>

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 5/11/2020 1:52:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Elke – Yes, I spoke with both Elizabeth and Dan and we can all be available for a call on Tuesday at 2pm. Thanks.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 5:23 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Would 2-3 on Tuesday work?

On May 8, 2020, at 4:37 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Elke –

I can make myself available at any time on Monday. Elizabeth's schedule is also pretty flexible. I need to confirm with Dan, but he, Elizabeth, and I are speaking first thing Monday morning and can make sure we coordinate our schedules with a time you propose.

In terms of the call, let me know if I can help on the logistics side or if you are all set on your side setting up a conference line for all the participants.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 8:11 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Elizabeth, this is compared to the original version-- that's correct. I have some computer IT issues to solve this morning before I can get back online. I can help figure out what to do about version control after that.

As for a larger call, I think we'd better plan on Monday at this point. But let me call you today to figure out process.

Elke

On May 8, 2020, at 6:37 AM, Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Elke,

Can you clarify what you meant by this being a response to our passback? I'm not seeing the earlier comments or any edits/comments made in response in this version. As for a call, today I can be available 9-9:45am or 11:30am-3pm. I will check who else from OP would wish to attend and let you all know their availability as soon as I can.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.Hodson@eop-omb.eop.gov> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Thursday, May 7, 2020 9:49 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, attached please find what can be considered largely a response to your earlier passback this week. We may have a few additional thoughts as we review your passback but this is comprehensive. We would like to schedule a call as soon as feasible to discuss.

Best, Elke

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: 4/20/2020 8:42:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Hi Leif, sorry I had another meeting. Feel free to just try me. My office # forwards to my cell. Just tried you again. I wanted to touch base and mention that it sounds like another call is being scheduled for Wednesday end of day.

Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
 Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
 Office of Management and Budget

[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 3:05 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Elke – Do you have time at 3:30pm today?

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 2:19 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Leif, do you have a few minutes to chat today?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 9:37 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Elke – Yes, I will check with individuals involved in the proposal and circle back with some possible times mid-week.

Please let me know if you need anything else. I will check with Elizabeth on the ANPRM.

Thanks,

Leif

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <**Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**>
Sent: Friday, April 17, 2020 8:36 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: BC CAA rule

Thanks, Elizabeth! I usually try to cc a few folks when we pass things back and forth so I'll keep both of you looped.

Leif, we'd like to set up an interagency briefing on the BCA rule. I can send the invite. What times is EPA available? Can we do earlier in the week like Tuesday or Wednesday?

Also, any chance you have a summary of the public comments for the ANPRM?

Elke

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:48 PM, Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Elke,
I'm happy to help but the official workgroup lead is Leif Hockstad in OAR. I'm cc'ing him above because I don't know what the correct protocol is. I'm the main person on the rule in office of policy.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:24 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
<**Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**> wrote:

Elizabeth, are you the rule lead for the BCA rule? Mary Manibusan pointed me your way. We would like to set up an interagency briefing for next week. Are you the right person to help me organize that?

Thanks!
Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget
Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Elke.L.HodsonMarten@epa.gov] [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: 4/28/2020 12:20:54 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Subject: BCA rule interagency comments
Attachments: EO 12866 BCA 2060-AU51 Interagency comments long form.docx; EO 12866 BCA 2060-AU51 NPRM-2020_04_03 Interagency comments 04272020.docx

All,

The interagency comments are attached. You have [Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)]

Best, Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]

[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: 4/22/2020 8:24:27 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Thanks, Leif.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 4:12 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Elke – Thank you for the EOP participants. I am checking with Kelley Raymond on the 4:30pm call. Please let me know if you need anything in the meantime.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 1:19 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Leif, I think the meeting invite below is probably the best list you'll have of the interagency attendees. From EOP you had

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

It might be best to ask Elizabeth about the 4:30 call. I can't speak to which career staff are being invited. We'll work with you to keep staff looped regardless of how the call is organized.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 11:19 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Elke – Thank you for organizing today's call. I took notes on the questions being asked but only got the agency and not their names. Is a participant list something you all will organize and send around?

Also when we spoke earlier this week you mentioned a call today at 4:30pm. I haven't gotten an invite and when I spoke with Kelley Raymond (OAR IO) she didn't have any particular details to share on it. Should I be prepared to join another discussion at 4:30pm?

Thanks,
Leif

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>

Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 5:46 PM

To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB; Hockstad, Leif; Kopits, Elizabeth; 'Reg Review (USDA)'; Karen.Villatoro@sba.gov; David Rostker; Reg Review (DOI); OS HHSExecSec; amathew@doc.gov; osd.mc-alex.ocmo.mbx.dod-reg-reviews@mail.mil; 'gc-71energyregs@hq.doe.gov'; eric.t.gormsen@usdoj.gov; robert.hinchman@usdoj.gov; Stacey Jensen; OIRA; PeckhamYM@state.gov; DOT.REGULATIONS@dot.gov; kBrown@doc.gov; patricia.l.toppings.civ@mail.mil; Lomax, Tinisha (OS/IOS)

Cc: Sharif, Shomaila (OST); Solomon, Gerald (OST); Gualtieri, David S (ENRD); Hostetler, Eric (ENRD); Mullins, Timothy (OST); Abbott, Linda - OCE, Washington, DC; Morrison, Jonathan (NHTSA); Waddell, J Thomas; Mojduszka, Eliza - OCE, Washington, DC; Glaze, Mark (FHWA); chloe.kolman@usdoj.gov; Lugo, Neha S; Simonoff, Jessica R; Lobel, Hannah J; Strickler, Giles D (FAA); Ortiz, Alexis J; McGartland, Al; Swiney, Gabriel; Wolfson, Steve; Smilansky, Gene; Montgomery, Mark (FTA); Baden, Joseph (FAA); Stone, April (FAA); Oweremohle, Kurt (FAA); Peter, Lorelei (FAA)

Subject: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM

When: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 9:45 AM-10:30 AM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).

Where [REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 4/22/2020 8:11:34 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Elke – Thank you for the EOP participants. I am checking with Kelley Raymond on the 4:30pm call. Please let me know if you need anything in the meantime.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 1:19 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Leif, I think the meeting invite below is probably the best list you'll have of the interagency attendees. From EOP you had

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

It might be best to ask Elizabeth about the 4:30 call. I can't speak to which career staff are being invited. We'll work with you to keep staff looped regardless of how the call is organized.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 11:19 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Elke – Thank you for organizing today's call. I took notes on the questions being asked but only got the agency and not their names. Is a participant list something you all will organize and send around?

Also when we spoke earlier this week you mentioned a call today at 4:30pm. I haven't gotten an invite and when I spoke with Kelley Raymond (OAR IO) she didn't have any particular details to share on it. Should I be prepared to join another discussion at 4:30pm?

Thanks,
 Leif

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 5:46 PM

To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB; Hockstad, Leif; Kopits, Elizabeth; 'Reg Review (USDA)'; Karen.Villatoro@sba.gov; David Rostker; Reg Review (DOI); OS HHSExecSec; amathew@doc.gov; osd.mc-alex.ocmo.mbx.dod-reg-reviews@mail.mil; 'gc-71energyregs@hq.doe.gov'; eric.t.gormsen@usdoj.gov; robert.hinchman@usdoj.gov; Stacey Jensen; OIRA; PeckhamYM@state.gov; DOT.REGULATIONS@dot.gov; kBrown@doc.gov; patricia.l.toppings.civ@mail.mil; Lomax, Tinisha (OS/IOS)

Cc: Sharif, Shomaila (OST); Solomon, Gerald (OST); Gualtieri, David S (ENRD); Hostetler, Eric (ENRD); Mullins, Timothy (OST); Abbott, Linda - OCE, Washington, DC; Morrison, Jonathan (NHTSA); Waddell, J Thomas; Mojdzieszka, Eliza - OCE, Washington, DC; Glaze, Mark (FHWA); chloe.kolman@usdoj.gov; Lugo, Neha S; Simonoff, Jessica R; Lobel, Hannah J; Strickler, Giles D (FAA); Ortiz, Alexis J; McGartland, Al; Swiney, Gabriel; Wolfson, Steve; Smilansky, Gene; Montgomery, Mark (FTA); Baden, Joseph (FAA); Stone, April (FAA); Oweremohle, Kurt (FAA); Peter, Lorelei (FAA)

Subject: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM

When: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 9:45 AM-10:30 AM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).

Where: **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: 5/8/2020 9:05:24 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Will this be a staff call or mixed staff and policy level call?

For a staff call, we can do late on Monday or Tuesday afternoon. I can look at our availability.

For a mixed staff and policy call, I'd have to check.

On May 8, 2020, at 4:52 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)> wrote:

Hi Leif, thanks. Can I give you a quick call to discuss? What is your cell number?

Mine is [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]

On May 8, 2020, at 4:37 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Elke –

I can make myself available at any time on Monday. Elizabeth's schedule is also pretty flexible. I need to confirm with Dan, but he, Elizabeth, and I are speaking first thing Monday morning and can make sure we coordinate our schedules with a time you propose.

In terms of the call, let me know if I can help on the logistics side or if you are all set on your side setting up a conference line for all the participants.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 8:11 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Elizabeth, this is compared to the original version-- that's correct. I have some computer IT issues to solve this morning before I can get back online. I can help figure out what to do about version control after that.

As for a larger call, I think we'd better plan on Monday at this point. But let me call you today to figure out process.

Elke

On May 8, 2020, at 6:37 AM, Kopits, Elizabeth
<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Elke,

Can you clarify what you meant by this being a response to our passback? I'm not seeing the earlier comments or any edits/comments made in response in this version. As for a call, today I can be available 9-9:45am or 11:30am-3pm. I will check who else from OP would wish to attend and let you all know their availability as soon as I can.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

<[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>

Sent: Thursday, May 7, 2020 9:49 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth
<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, attached please find what can be considered largely a response to your earlier passback this week. We may have a few additional thoughts as we review your passback but this is comprehensive. We would like to schedule a call as soon as feasible to discuss.

Best, Elke

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 6/2/2020 1:02:16 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

OK, and please let us know if there is anything we can help for your review. I think EPA's management has spoken with OIRA management about the need for a quick turnaround. Thanks.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 9:36 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, all. Received and circulated. Thanks for the availability. I get back to you once we've circled internally.

Elke

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:35 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document ("...EPA-2") with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.HodsonMarten@Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)> Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA

Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the

[REDACTED] Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)> wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 6/2/2020 5:52:34 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Let me confirm how the invitations are moving around over on our side and will get back to you. I also thought this was a staff level call.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 1:42 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Leif, I see your political appointee accepted. If EPA was planning on doing a mixed policy and staff call, I would need to reschedule to include ours as well. Thanks.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:11 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Yes, we can do a staff call at 3pm. Thanks.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:01 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Could you do a staff call at 3 today?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:35 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document ("...EPA-2") with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]> Kopits, Elizabeth
<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy
<Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy
<Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]>; Kopits, Elizabeth
<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy
<Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB { **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** }
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.HodsonMarten@epa.gov> { **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** } wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 6/2/2020 12:34:45 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]; Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
CC: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3
Attachments: 2060-AU51 NPRM 06 01 2020 EPA-2.docx

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document (“...EPA-2”) with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]; Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Cc: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]

Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>

Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM

To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP

OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)

OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B

1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA

Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>

Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]> wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 5/6/2020 3:27:58 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Elke.L.HodsonMarten@omb.eop.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

OK, sounds good. Thanks.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Tuesday, May 5, 2020 9:56 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Cc: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Thanks, Leif. I'll get back to you on the offer of a call. I hope to send you the remaining EOP comments in the next day or two.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, May 5, 2020 2:40 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Cc: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Elke –

Attached are EPA's responses and proposed edits from the OMB comments in the April 23 passback. The document also includes responses to interagency comments as sent by OMB on April 27.

Please let me know if it would be convenient to set up a time to review the responses this week and also to discuss further OMB comments that you all might be working on.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 8:52 AM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM

All, please find an initial passback in the attached. This is a partial passback that does not include interagency comments or even all EOP comments, but hopefully will help get things started. You should see some of the topics mentioned yesterday reflected in this passback as well as placeholders.

Please feel free to reach out with any questions. I expect that the next passback will be next week.

Best, Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 5/28/2020 2:52:06 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)] Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: update

Elke – You can work off the batch 1 version for your additional comments in batch 3. But if you all could accept all the changes before adding in the batch 3 line edits that would make it much easier for us to understand and process. And like with batch 1 and batch 2, if you highlight any new comment bubbles in a new color then we can find those easily too.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 8:24 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: update

Will do. Do you have a preference for me working off of the batch 1 version we just sent or the 5/15 version you sent last?

On May 27, 2020, at 4:09 PM, Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Please either accept all other changes so that we can easily find new line edits, or highlight the new ones to the extent possible.

And to the extent possible, if there are any new comments or line edits that conflict with comments in either batch 1 or 2 please let us know which version is OMB's preference.

Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Wednesday, May 27, 2020 4:01 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: update

All, Probably batch 3 will come late tonight at this point. I am not sure what to do about version control.

Elke

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: 5/18/2020 9:35:29 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Leif, that's fine. You have the agency comments now. Up to EPA how you want to handle those.

I'll get back to you likely tomorrow on a mixed policy/staff call.

Best, Elke

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, May 18, 2020 5:24 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.HodsonMarten@omb.eop.gov>
Subject: RE: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Elke –

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <**Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**>
Sent: Monday, May 18, 2020 3:54 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>

Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, the agency responses on your first passback are attached. For the agency commenter who provided inline comments, you can find them by looking for the yellow highlights.

Elke

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: 6/3/2020 5:09:26 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
CC: Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Thank you.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 12:59 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Hi Elke,

Attached is the current draft. Please let us know if there is anything that would still benefit from discussion. Any edits we made on your passback from last night are flagged.

Thanks,
 Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:09 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

All, please find the passback in the attached.

1. The OMB2 document is clean with new edits tracked. Any new responses are marked with "6/2".
2. The second document has mainly copy edits. The changes are labelled with yellow highlight and "6-2-20".

Elke

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: 5/8/2020 1:49:21 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Subject: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process
Attachments: EO 12866 Interagency Comments BCA NPRM RIN 2060-AU51.docx; ATT00001.htm

All, attached please find what can be considered largely a response to your earlier passback this week. We may have a few additional thoughts as we review your passback but this is comprehensive. We would like to schedule a call as soon as feasible to discuss.

Best, Elke

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 5/5/2020 6:39:47 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Elke.L.HodsonMarten@omb.eop.gov]; Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
CC: Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"
Attachments: EO 12866 BCA 2060-AU51 NPRM-2020_04_03 OMB1Interagency_5.05.20 EPA.docx

Elke –

Attached are EPA's responses and proposed edits from the OMB comments in the April 23 passback. The document also includes responses to interagency comments as sent by OMB on April 27.

Please let me know if it would be convenient to set up a time to review the responses this week and also to discuss further OMB comments that you all might be working on.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 8:52 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

All, please find an initial passback in the attached. This is a partial passback that does not include interagency comments or even all EOP comments, but hopefully will help get things started. You should see some of the topics mentioned yesterday reflected in this passback as well as placeholders.

Please feel free to reach out with any questions. I expect that the next passback will be next week.

Best, Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
 Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
 Office of Management and Budget

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: 5/18/2020 7:53:34 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Subject: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process
Attachments: Interagency comments Round 2 NPRM 2060-AU51.docx; EO 12866 BCA 2060-AU51 NPRM-2020_04_03 OMB1Interagency_5.05.20 EPA additional comments.docx

All, the agency responses on your first passback are attached. For the agency commenter who provided inline comments, you can find them by looking for the yellow highlights.

Elke

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 6/1/2020 5:18:16 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)]; Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
CC: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3
Attachments: 2060-AU51 NPRM 06 01 2020 EPA1.docx

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)]
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)] wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: 5/15/2020 9:10:11 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Thanks, Leif.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 15, 2020 3:51 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Elke – We are compiling responses to comments and I am hoping to get you something by the end of today.

We aren't going to have all the responses as I think there may need to be an OMB and EPA policy-level call to discuss some remaining items (somewhat continuing staff-level OMB-EPA call earlier this week). I know times are going to be very difficult to shake free but I wanted to at least put it in your mind that we might try to schedule something next week.

I will be in touch a little later today.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 5:23 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Would 2-3 on Tuesday work?

On May 8, 2020, at 4:37 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Elke –

I can make myself available at any time on Monday. Elizabeth's schedule is also pretty flexible. I need to confirm with Dan, but he, Elizabeth, and I are speaking first thing Monday morning and can make sure we coordinate our schedules with a time you propose.

In terms of the call, let me know if I can help on the logistics side or if you are all set on your side setting up a conference line for all the participants.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 8:11 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Elizabeth, this is compared to the original version-- that's correct. I have some computer IT issues to solve this morning before I can get back online. I can help figure out what to do about version control after that.

As for a larger call, I think we'd better plan on Monday at this point. But let me call you today to figure out process.

Elke

On May 8, 2020, at 6:37 AM, Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Elke,

Can you clarify what you meant by this being a response to our passback? I'm not seeing the earlier comments or any edits/comments made in response in this version. As for a call, today I can be available 9-9:45am or 11:30am-3pm. I will check who else from OP would wish to attend and let you all know their availability as soon as I can.

Thanks,
 Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, May 7, 2020 9:49 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, attached please find what can be considered largely a response to your earlier passback this week. We may have a few additional thoughts as we review your passback but this is comprehensive. We would like to schedule a call as soon as feasible to discuss.

Best, Elke

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 4/28/2020 8:26:39 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Subject: RE: BCA rule interagency comments

Elke – I realized I forgot to respond this morning. Confirming receipt of additional interagency comments. We are still working on initial passback and may reach out to discuss further.

Thanks,
Leif

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Monday, April 27, 2020 8:21 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: BCA rule interagency comments

All,

The interagency comments are attached. [Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)]

Best, Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]

[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: 4/22/2020 1:15:34 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Thanks, Leif.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 9:15 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Yes, it would be fine to forward these to other reviewers.

Thanks,
 Leif

On Apr 21, 2020, at 6:28 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)> wrote:

Thanks, all. Are you Ok with me circulating the ANPRM comments document to reviewers?

On Apr 21, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Elke –

Please find attached materials for tomorrow's meeting. We have provided an overview of the proposal and also a document with a summary of comments from the ANPRM as you requested.

Thanks,
 Leif

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>

Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 5:46 PM

To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB; Hockstad, Leif; Kopits, Elizabeth; 'Reg Review (USDA)'; Karen.Villatoro@sba.gov; David Rostker; Reg Review (DOI); OS HHSExecSec; amathew@doc.gov; osd.mc-alex.ocmo.mbx.dod-reg-reviews@mail.mil; 'gc-71energyregs@hq.doe.gov'; eric.t.gormsen@usdoj.gov; robert.hinchman@usdoj.gov; Stacey Jensen; OIRA; PeckhamYM@state.gov; DOT.REGULATIONS@dot.gov

Subject: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM

When: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 9:45 AM-10:30 AM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).

Where: Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

<BC NPRM_1 pager overview for NCEE_short-OAR.docx>

<ANPRM_overview of public comments_OP-vOAR.docx>

Message

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Sent: 4/20/2020 9:52:23 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Great. Will you have slides?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 5:37 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Yes, I think we can make it work in 45 minutes. Thanks.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 5:36 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Leif, if we do 9:45-10:30 for this briefing will that leave enough time for Q&A?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 3:05 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Elke – Do you have time at 3:30pm today?

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 2:19 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Leif, do you have a few minutes to chat today?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 9:37 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Elke – Yes, I will check with individuals involved in the proposal and circle back with some possible times mid-week.

Please let me know if you need anything else. I will check with Elizabeth on the ANPRM.

Thanks,

Leif

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB { **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** }

Sent: Friday, April 17, 2020 8:36 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>

Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: BC CAA rule

Thanks, Elizabeth! I usually try to cc a few folks when we pass things back and forth so I'll keep both of you looped.

Leif, we'd like to set up an interagency briefing on the BCA rule. I can send the invite. What times is EPA available? Can we do earlier in the week like Tuesday or Wednesday?

Also, any chance you have a summary of the public comments for the ANPRM?

Elke

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:48 PM, Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Elke,

I'm happy to help but the official workgroup lead is Leif Hockstad in OAR. I'm cc'ing him above because I don't know what the correct protocol is. I'm the main person on the rule in office of policy.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:24 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

{ **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** } wrote:

Elizabeth, are you the rule lead for the BCA rule? Mary Manibusan pointed me your way. We would like to set up an interagency briefing for next week. Are you the right person to help me organize that?

Thanks!
Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

{ **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** }

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Message

From: Langdon, Robin [Langdon.Robin@epa.gov]
Sent: 5/21/2020 9:48:10 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Weatherhead, Darryl [Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov]; Fann, Neal [Fann.Neal@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Thank you Leif.

I was on the call just now but missed the chance to say I was there because I couldn't unmute fast enough:-/

Thanks again for keeping us in the loop.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Thursday, May 21, 2020 1:16 PM
To: Langdon, Robin <Langdon.Robin@epa.gov>; Weatherhead, Darryl <Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov>; Fann, Neal <Fann.Neal@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

EPA's responses and proposed edits from the OMB comments in the April 23 passback and also includes responses to interagency comments as sent by OMB on April 27. This response document was sent to OMB on Tuesday, May 5

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Monday, May 18, 2020 3:54 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, the agency responses on your first passback are attached. For the agency commenter who provided inline comments, you can find them by looking for the yellow highlights.

Elke

Message

From: Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
Sent: 5/27/2020 1:13:05 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 NPRM passback--batch 1

Thanks. Are the new revisions the ones highlighted in green? Also, did she also send a second batch last night as mentioned in her email?

Amy Lamson
Policy and Regulatory Analysis Division, Office of Policy
U.S. EPA
202-564-3949

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, May 26, 2020 5:34 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: 2060-AU51 NPRM passback--batch 1

FYI

From: Thomas, Amanda L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Tuesday, May 26, 2020 5:18 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: 2060-AU51 NPRM passback--batch 1

Please find attached the first batch of the passbacks. Will be second a second batch tonight. There may be a 3rd batch tomorrow.

Thanks for your patience. Amanda

Message

From: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Sent: 4/28/2020 2:56:05 PM
To: Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]; Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: BCA rule interagency comments

Sure thing. For now, all we can report is that we received a partial set of OMB comments last Thursday (4/23), a set of interagency comments late yesterday (4/27), and there is a call with DOJ tomorrow (4/29). We expect additional written comments from OMB but it is unclear when that will happen, and it is unclear when/if there will be another call with OMB before they send their additional comments.

Hope that helps for now.

Thanks,
 Elizabeth

From: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 28, 2020 10:42 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BCA rule interagency comments

After you have reviewed the comments, can you please let me know when you plan to send responses back to OMB? I have to report on this type of information (as well as any other interagency communication) weekly.

Amy Lamson
 Policy and Regulatory Analysis Division, Office of Policy
 U.S. EPA
 202-564-3949

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 27, 2020 9:18 PM
To: McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Munis, Ken <Munis.Ken@epa.gov>; Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>; Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: BCA rule interagency comments

Hi All,

Here are the interagency comments on the B-C rule. I will read them over in the morning.

Best,
 Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Monday, April 27, 2020 8:21 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: BCA rule interagency comments

All,

The interagency comments are attached. You have

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Best, Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.

Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs

Office of Management and Budget

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Message

From: Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
Sent: 5/21/2020 4:14:05 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

I heard that there may be a call on risk assessment issues either today or tomorrow. Is this a staff-level call or a politicals only call? If it includes staff, please include me.

Thanks!

Amy Lamson
 Policy and Regulatory Analysis Division, Office of Policy
 U.S. EPA
 202-564-3949

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, May 20, 2020 10:54 AM
To: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Amy – We only got the interagency responses to our responses to their comments. We haven't heard back from OMB on either of the responses we sent them to their rounds of comments.

We might be trying to set up a call on Friday morning, and I'll let you know when that comes together.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, May 19, 2020 5:28 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Have we heard back from Elke on any raised issues yet?

Amy Lamson
 Policy and Regulatory Analysis Division, Office of Policy
 U.S. EPA
 202-564-3949

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.Hodson@epa.gov>
Sent: Saturday, May 16, 2020 10:44 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Thanks, Leif. Received. We've been asked to raise any items by Monday first thing so you may hear from us rather on the sooner side.

On May 15, 2020, at 6:10 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Elke –

Attached are EPA's initial responses to comments out of the most recent passback along with our further considerations after the OMB-EPA call earlier this week.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Additionally there are still a few items which EPA is working through and OGC is still working to respond to DOJ comments. We think next week if we can have the detailed discussion on the risk assessment section and allow further internal deliberations on DOJ feedback we will be able to move closer to addressing all comments. The rule text still has comments but we are waiting to confirm the preamble edits before turning to address those.

Have a nice weekend and I will be in touch early next week.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Hodson.Marten@epa.gov> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Thursday, May 7, 2020 9:49 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, attached please find what can be considered largely a response to your earlier passback this week. We may have a few additional thoughts as we review your passback but this is comprehensive. We would like to schedule a call as soon as feasible to discuss.

Best, Elke

<EO 12866 Interagency Comments BCA NPRM RIN 2060-AU51_05.15.20 EPA1.docx>

Message

From: Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
Sent: 5/19/2020 6:21:38 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Thanks. Can you provide your timeline for responding to these comments?

Also, do you intend to address the issues I raised previously in the next passback (e.g., CFR sections, docket center closing)?

Amy Lamson
 Policy and Regulatory Analysis Division, Office of Policy
 U.S. EPA
 202-564-3949

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, May 18, 2020 7:46 PM
To: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

FYI – I am trying to work with Elke to keep the version control synced up on these comment documents.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Monday, May 18, 2020 3:54 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, the agency responses on your first passback are attached. For the agency commenter who provided inline comments, you can find them by looking for the yellow highlights.

Elke

Message

From: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Sent: 4/23/2020 12:07:44 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Tuesday 1-2 is the only time that does not work for me next week.

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 9:27 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

And to clarify, we can do some times after 1p on Wed, so will wait to hear what works for EPA.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
Sent: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 9:25 PM
To: 'Hockstad, Leif' <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

All, DOJ wants to relay comments by phone. These are the times that work for ENRD and OMB. Can you let me know what works for EPA?

Tuesday 1-2 or 4-5 or
 Wednesday after 1

Elke

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 9:15 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Yes, it would be fine to forward these to other reviewers.

Thanks,

Leif

On Apr 21, 2020, at 6:28 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[\[REDACTED\]](#)> wrote:

Thanks, all. Are you Ok with me circulating the ANPRM comments document to reviewers?

On Apr 21, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Elke –

Please find attached materials for tomorrow's meeting. We have provided an overview of the proposal and also a document with a summary of comments from the ANPRM as you requested.

Thanks,
Leif

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[\[REDACTED\]](#)>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 5:46 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB; Hockstad, Leif; Kopits, Elizabeth; 'Reg Review (USDA)'; Karen.Villatoro@sba.gov; David Rostker; Reg Review (DOI); OS HHSExecSec; amathew@doc.gov; osd.mc-alex.ocmo.mbx.dod-reg-reviews@mail.mil; 'gc-71energyregs@hq.doe.gov'; eric.t.gormsen@usdoj.gov; robert.hinchman@usdoj.gov; Stacey Jensen; OIRA; PeckhamYM@state.gov; DOT.REGULATIONS@dot.gov
Subject: EO 12866 Interagency Briefing on EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"
When: Wednesday, April 22, 2020 9:45 AM-10:30 AM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).
Where [\[REDACTED\]](#)

<BC NPRM_1 pager overview for NCEE_short-OAR.docx>
<ANPRM_overview of public comments_OP-vOAR.docx>

Message

From: Raymond, Kelley [Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov]
Sent: 4/20/2020 3:09:42 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
CC: Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Kelley Raymond
 Office of Air and Radiation
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 10:20 AM
To: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Oh and in regard to Elke's request for a comment summary on the ANPRM, here is what OP used to brief the Administrator early last year. Your thoughts on its appropriateness for OMB would be great to hear. Thanks.

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 9:15 AM
To: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: BC CAA rule

FYI – I am also going to check with Elizabeth and Dan about their availability this week.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Friday, April 17, 2020 8:36 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: BC CAA rule

Thanks, Elizabeth! I usually try to cc a few folks when we pass things back and forth so I'll keep both of you looped.

Leif, we'd like to set up an interagency briefing on the BCA rule. I can send the invite. What times is EPA available? Can we do earlier in the week like Tuesday or Wednesday?

Also, any chance you have a summary of the public comments for the ANPRM?

Elke

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:48 PM, Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Elke,

I'm happy to help but the official workgroup lead is Leif Hockstad in OAR. I'm cc'ing him above because I don't know what the correct protocol is. I'm the main person on the rule in office of policy.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:24 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

<**Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**> wrote:

Elizabeth, are you the rule lead for the BCA rule? Mary Manibusan pointed me your way. We would like to set up an interagency briefing for next week. Are you the right person to help me organize that?

Thanks!
Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Message

From: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Sent: 4/20/2020 2:36:33 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Ok, great. Also, since this is a CAA rule, if the ANPRM summary is sent over to OMB it will be part of the docket and considered part of the record for the NPRM. Maybe worth checking w/ Dan also to see OGCs opinion.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 10:21 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Yes, the file you sent was exactly what I was remembering. Thanks.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 10:19 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Ok sounds good. Not sure which administrator's summary you are referring to, but I recommend also sending her the file I just sent you because it contains only a summary of the public comments. Most of the other briefing docs we have from early 2019 also include discussion of policy options and the path forward, which is internal deliberative stuff outside of what Elke asked for and I'm sure not something that EPA would send to OMB.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 10:15 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Elizabeth –

Yes, hanging in there. I hope you are also doing well.

I passed Elke's note to Kelley but haven't heard back yet on how she might envision the briefing going. I will also forward along the March 2019 Administrator's summary to see if Kelley would like to pass that to OMB.

Let me get some reactions and responses and then I will send a note about finding a time to chat some more on this.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 9:54 AM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Hi Leif,

I hope you are well. I can be available any time for the briefing, although Tuesday (tomorrow) or before 1pm on Wed look best. If this is meant to be staff level only briefing then I think you, me, Dan, and Amy would be fine, but I will give Al a heads up about it too to see if he or anyone else from our office should attend. Perhaps best to decide based on who Elke says will be attending from their end.

As for a summary of ANPRM comments, the only things I have are what we used internally for briefing purposes (e.g., see attached). You should probably run it by Kelley to see if she wants to share as is, or in some shortened form.

Happy to chat more by phone this morning if helpful.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>

Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 9:40 AM

To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Elizabeth – Do you think the couple pager that you all prepared for the Administrator earlier last year would be appropriate to pass to OMB?

Also what is your availability mid-week? I was thinking that I would definitely involve you and Dan on the call (and Amy).

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>

Sent: Friday, April 17, 2020 8:36 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>

Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: BC CAA rule

Thanks, Elizabeth! I usually try to cc a few folks when we pass things back and forth so I'll keep both of you looped.

Leif, we'd like to set up an interagency briefing on the BCA rule. I can send the invite. What times is EPA available? Can we do earlier in the week like Tuesday or Wednesday?

Also, any chance you have a summary of the public comments for the ANPRM?

Elke

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:48 PM, Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Elke,

I'm happy to help but the official workgroup lead is Leif Hockstad in OAR. I'm cc'ing him above because I don't know what the correct protocol is. I'm the main person on the rule in office of policy.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:24 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

<[REDACTED] Ex. 6 PP / Ex. 7(C) [REDACTED]> wrote:

Elizabeth, are you the rule lead for the BCA rule? Mary Manibusan pointed me your way. We would like to set up an interagency briefing for next week. Are you the right person to help me organize that?

Thanks!
Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

[REDACTED] **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** [REDACTED]
[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]

Message

From: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/2/2020 2:20:40 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Ex. 5 Attorney Client (AC)

Daniel H. Conrad
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of General Counsel
Air and Radiation Law Office
(202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 02, 2020 9:12 AM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Ex. 5 Attorney Client (AC)

Thanks,
Leif

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 8:53 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

There's obviously still clean up to be done here, do we have a working document for that or are we waiting for OMB and then will start on that?

Daniel H. Conrad
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of General Counsel
Air and Radiation Law Office
(202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 01, 2020 8:35 PM

To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document (“...EPA-2”) with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.HodsonMarten@epa.gov> [REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy \(PP\)](mailto:Ex.6PersonalPrivacy(PP)@epa.gov)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy \(PP\)](mailto:Ex.6PersonalPrivacy(PP)@epa.gov)>
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 PP / Ex. 7\(C\)](mailto:Ex.6PP/Ex.7(C)@epa.gov)> wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Sent: 5/26/2020 9:44:56 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 NPRM passback--batch 1

I know. It's going to be a huge pain.

I will try to start looking at it this evening . Let's try to touch base mid morning tomorrow maybe?

Sent from my iPhone

On May 26, 2020, at 5:37 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

I passed this along to Dan (and Amy).

Unfortunately the anonymized all the comments to be listed as "Author" so now even your comments which had your name on them in the last passback just say "Author" now.

From: Thomas, Amanda L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Tuesday, May 26, 2020 5:18 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: 2060-AU51 NPRM passback--batch 1

Please find attached the first batch of the passbacks. Will be second a second batch tonight. There may be a 3rd batch tomorrow.

Thanks for your patience. Amanda

Message

From: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Sent: 5/12/2020 5:18:33 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

I'm fine with working my own draft through my folks as well, then we can consolidate.

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, May 12, 2020 1:14 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

I am aiming to get my responses to NCEE folks by sometime tomorrow and hope to have consolidated NCEE responses/suggestions to you all by Thursday. Is that OK, or would you like me to add you to my onedrive working version while NCEE folks are still chiming in?

Best,
 Elizabeth

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, May 12, 2020 12:53 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Are we responding on a sharepoint version of the new document yet?

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 08, 2020 4:14 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

I combined the comment response document we sent back earlier this week with the latest set of OMB comments. Unfortunately when combining you still get the generic, anonymous "Author" for all OMB comments but the old ones should have responses from Elizabeth while the new comments don't have any responses.

I still think the easiest and most straight-forward approach would be to take the latest document from Elke and respond in that document alone to its comments. Looking at the two sets of comments I don't think they overlap so that our previous response answers the newer comment. If we track the new comments document alone it would be a cleaner way to review our responses.

I think after we work through the second round of comments I can combine the two response documents and then we can double-check our responses and text changes to keep straight what we are sending back to OMB. Again we'll see on Monday (or this evening) what times Elke proposes for our call and what she might provide for that.

We can discuss more on Monday morning. Have a good weekend and stay safe.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 9:20 AM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Yes, these comments are on the original proposal and include a considerable overlay on top of the comments we already responded to.

I assume that Elke won't schedule their follow-up until maybe Monday afternoon. Do we want to take today to review these and think about them and then the 3 of us have our usual Monday morning call to discuss? I'm not sure we'd have answers for OMB on Monday but at least we can all talk through how we want to approach and timing for the subsequent EPA responses.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 8:03 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

I see you had the same reaction I did, I'm available for most of today until 2:00 but won't be able to have digested these comments in full and have any fleshed out response so it would mostly be to have them talking to us, not sure on other's availability or who else should be on.

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Sent: Friday, May 08, 2020 6:38 AM

To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.Hodson@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Hi Elke,

Can you clarify what you meant by this being a response to our passback? I'm not seeing the earlier comments or any edits/comments made in response in this version. As for a call, today I can be available 9-9:45am or 11:30am-3pm. I will check who else from OP would wish to attend and let you all know their availability as soon as I can.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.Hodson@epa.gov> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**

Sent: Thursday, May 7, 2020 9:49 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, attached please find what can be considered largely a response to your earlier passback this week. We may have a few additional thoughts as we review your passback but this is comprehensive. We would like to schedule a call as soon as feasible to discuss.

Best, Elke

Message

From: Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/2/2020 1:49:16 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Leif,

There are 3 and she'd like to know who'll join from subgroup presumably. On top of Wed. Cong'l, stakeholder group Thurs at 10 with Admin and Press Thurs at 11:30.

Kelley just shared an update and is hoping for OMB clearance today, fingers crossed.

Any feedback on Isabel's Comms plan, think she thought Mandy wanted more on why we're doing the rule, e.g., justification statement and perhaps emanating from Wheeler memo or ANPRM.

Other stuff –

- Anything more from OAQPS?
- OGC review timing?
- Did you get what was needed on FR Dallies item?
- Anything else you need help with?

Should we've a catch up later this PM and to review what I can help cover/do tomorrow? Thanks!

John

JOHN SHOAFF | DIRECTOR
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442-C
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Shoaff.John@epa.gov | 1-202-564-0531 DIRECT | 1-202-257-1755 MOBILE

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 9:40 AM
To: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

John – can you remind me again about the various rollout calls that Kelley is referencing? I just remember you talking about a Congressional briefing at 4pm on Wednesday and then a couple things Wheeler is doing on Thursday. Are there more?

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:54 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thank you Leif! Did you all discuss and decide who should do the technical backup for the various rollout calls on the 3rd and 4th? I've had a couple pings from OCIR and OPA as they would like to include the names in the Administrator's briefing materials.

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 1, 2020, at 8:50 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Kelley – Here is the complete comment response and revised text document that I just sent back to OMB. As I indicated to Elke, we can make ourselves available tomorrow to talk through any parts of our responses and text.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:35 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document (“...EPA-2”) with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <**Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**>
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
<**Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**> wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>
<2060-AU51 NPRM 06 01 2020 EPA-2.docx>

Message

From: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Sent: 4/20/2020 1:54:16 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule
Attachments: ANPRM_overview of public comments_3.7.19.docx

Hi Leif,

I hope you are well. I can be available any time for the briefing, although Tuesday (tomorrow) or before 1pm on Wed look best. If this is meant to be staff level only briefing then I think you, me, Dan, and Amy would be fine, but I will give Al a heads up about it too to see if he or anyone else from our office should attend. Perhaps best to decide based on who Elke says will be attending from their end.

As for a summary of ANPRM comments, the only things I have are what we used internally for briefing purposes (e.g., see attached). You should probably run it by Kelley to see if she wants to share as is, or in some shortened form.

Happy to chat more by phone this morning if helpful.

Thanks,
 Elizabeth

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 9:40 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Elizabeth – Do you think the couple pager that you all prepared for the Administrator earlier last year would be appropriate to pass to OMB?

Also what is your availability mid-week? I was thinking that I would definitely involve you and Dan on the call (and Amy).

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Friday, April 17, 2020 8:36 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: BC CAA rule

Thanks, Elizabeth! I usually try to cc a few folks when we pass things back and forth so I'll keep both of you looped.

Leif, we'd like to set up an interagency briefing on the BCA rule. I can send the invite. What times is EPA available? Can we do earlier in the week like Tuesday or Wednesday?

Also, any chance you have a summary of the public comments for the ANPRM?

Elke

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:48 PM, Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Elke,

I'm happy to help but the official workgroup lead is Leif Hockstad in OAR. I'm cc'ing him above because I don't know what the correct protocol is. I'm the main person on the rule in office of policy.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:24 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

{ **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** } wrote:

Elizabeth, are you the rule lead for the BCA rule? Mary Manibusan pointed me your way. We would like to set up an interagency briefing for next week. Are you the right person to help me organize that?

Thanks!
Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

{ **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** }

{ **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** }

Message

From: Raymond, Kelley [Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov]
Sent: 5/8/2020 5:21:41 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
CC: Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Okay, thanks!

Kelley Raymond
Office of Air and Radiation
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 1:19 PM
To: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Thanks,
Leif

From: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 12:42 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Kelley Raymond
Office of Air and Radiation
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 9:23 AM
To: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Sent: Thursday, May 7, 2020 9:49 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, attached please find what can be considered largely a response to your earlier passback this week. We may have a few additional thoughts as we review your passback but this is comprehensive. We would like to schedule a call as soon as feasible to discuss.

Best, Elke

Message

From: Schwab, Margo EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: 5/27/2020 6:45:18 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
 <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
CC: McGartland, Al [McGartland.Al@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Hockstad, Leif
 [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Griffiths, Charles [Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov]; Dockins, Chris [Dockins.Chris@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: batch 1 walk through

All -- We now have a conflict. There isn't an immediate need to meet. Just let us know if you have any questions.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, May 27, 2020 2:01 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Schwab, Margo EOP/OMB
 <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Cc: McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif
 <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Griffiths, Charles <Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov>; Dockins, Chris <Dockins.Chris@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: batch 1 walk through

Ok ,so then there will NOT be a revised batch 1 coming to us? I just really need to know so that I don't start incorporating edits from last night's version and end up getting another version later today.
 And what about batch 3?

Looping in others who will likely want to try to join the call if they are available.

Thanks,
 Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Wednesday, May 27, 2020 1:55 PM
To: Schwab, Margo EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: batch 1 walk through

We should use the version she sent last night. Let's do 3pm then. I'll send an invite.

From: Schwab, Margo EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Wednesday, May 27, 2020 1:44 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
 <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Cc: McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: batch 1 walk through

We just wanted to point out a few places where our suggestions (in the context of our prior conversations) might not be obvious because the passback is now de-identified.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, May 27, 2020 1:29 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>

Cc: McGartland, Al <McGartland.Al@epa.gov>; Schwab, Margo EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>

Subject: Re: batch 1 walk through

I can make anytime in that window.

Will you or Amanda be sending a revised batch 1 ahead of it, or should we expect to be talking through the one Amanda sent last night?

Thanks,
Elizabeth

Sent from my iPhone

On May 27, 2020, at 12:52 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

<[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)> wrote:

Elizabeth and Al, do you have time for a call in the 2:30-4 space today?

Elke

Message

From: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Sent: 5/19/2020 8:16:05 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: call

Sounds good, I'm wide open on Friday.

Daniel H. Conrad
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of General Counsel
Air and Radiation Law Office
(202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, May 19, 2020 4:10 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: call

Dan – We are trying to coordinate a time on Friday to have an OMB-EPA staff + policy call to further discuss the risk assessment section of the proposal. I'm not sure if it is critical for you to attend on just that one piece but your availability and willingness to listen in would be appreciated.

OMB wants after 2pm on Friday but Kelley wants before 2pm on Friday so we'll see how this shakes out.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB { **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** }
Sent: Tuesday, May 19, 2020 2:57 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: call

Leif, it looks like we can do a mixed staff and policy call after 2pm on Friday.

Best, Elke

Message

From: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Sent: 5/8/2020 1:44:49 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
CC: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Yes, sounds like a good plan. I can be available any time on Monday for both our morning call and a later call with OMB. I will get you other OP folks' availability for an OMB call as soon as I can.

Thanks!
 Elizabeth

On May 8, 2020, at 9:20 AM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Yes, these comments are on the original proposal and include a considerable overlay on top of the comments we already responded to.

I assume that Elke won't schedule their follow-up until maybe Monday afternoon. Do we want to take today to review these and think about them and then the 3 of us have our usual Monday morning call to discuss? I'm not sure we'd have answers for OMB on Monday but at least we can all talk through how we want to approach and timing for the subsequent EPA responses.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 8:03 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

I see you had the same reaction I did, I'm available for most of today until 2:00 but won't be able to have digested these comments in full and have any fleshed out response so it would mostly be to have them talking to us, not sure on other's availability or who else should be on.

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 08, 2020 6:38 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]; Hockstad, Leif

<Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Hi Elke,

Can you clarify what you meant by this being a response to our passback? I'm not seeing the earlier comments or any edits/comments made in response in this version. As for a call, today I can be available 9-9:45am or 11:30am-3pm. I will check who else from OP would wish to attend and let you all know their availability as soon as I can.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>

Sent: Thursday, May 7, 2020 9:49 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, attached please find what can be considered largely a response to your earlier passback this week. We may have a few additional thoughts as we review your passback but this is comprehensive. We would like to schedule a call as soon as feasible to discuss.

Best, Elke

Message

From: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/3/2020 7:57:58 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)] Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
CC: Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51
Attachments: 2060-AU51 NPRM 06 01 2020 EPA-2_060320_344PMC CLEAN.docx

Thanks, Elke. We accepted all the changes. Attached is the clean final version.

Thanks,
 Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 3:21 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Hi Elizabeth, changes marked with a comment box that says "6/3 1:30pm" and highlighted in green. I'll try to reach you in a minute on one thing.

Elke

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 12:59 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)] Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Hi Elke,

Attached is the current draft. Please let us know if there is anything that would still benefit from discussion. Any edits we made on your passback from last night are flagged.

Thanks,
 Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:09 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

All, please find the passback in the attached.

1. The OMB2 document is clean with new edits tracked. Any new responses are marked with "6/2".
2. The second document has mainly copy edits. The changes are labelled with yellow highlight and "6-2-20".

Elke

Message

From: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/3/2020 7:55:56 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
CC: Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 3:38 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Wednesday, June 03, 2020 3:21 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Hi Elizabeth, changes marked with a comment box that says "6/3 1:30pm" and highlighted in green. I'll try to reach you in a minute on one thing.

Elke

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 12:59 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Hi Elke,

Attached is the current draft. Please let us know if there is anything that would still benefit from discussion. Any edits we made on your passback from last night are flagged.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:09 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

All, please find the passback in the attached.

1. The OMB2 document is clean with new edits tracked. Any new responses are marked with "6/2".
2. The second document has mainly copy edits. The changes are labelled with yellow highlight and "6-2-20".

Elke

Message

From: Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/1/2020 9:17:12 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thank you. Please keep me closely in the loop. My office (ORPM) has a lot we have to do in a short time to meet that schedule.

Amy Lamson
 Policy and Regulatory Analysis Division, Office of Policy
 U.S. EPA
 202-564-3949

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 01, 2020 4:37 PM
To: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

I think they're aiming for OMB clearance tomorrow and final signature on Thursday.

From: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 3:46 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Are we anticipating this to wrap up soon? If so, what have you heard re: timing of OMB clearance and signature?

Amy Lamson
 Policy and Regulatory Analysis Division, Office of Policy
 U.S. EPA
 202-564-3949

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 01, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]> Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]>
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]> wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Sent: 5/8/2020 11:45:26 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Looks like there is a significant amount of new commentary here, rather than a response to our pass back.

Daniel H. Conrad
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of General Counsel
Air and Radiation Law Office
(202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, May 07, 2020 9:49 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, attached please find what can be considered largely a response to your earlier passback this week. We may have a few additional thoughts as we review your passback but this is comprehensive. We would like to schedule a call as soon as feasible to discuss.

Best, Elke

Message

From: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/3/2020 4:11:03 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

I've put them in **Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)** and even these are very minor.

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 03, 2020 11:43 AM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

The live onedrive version.

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 11:39 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Leif, I have a few very minor edits from my front office, what version would be best for me to incorporate them?

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <**Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**>
Sent: Tuesday, June 02, 2020 11:09 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

All, please find the passback in the attached.

1. The OMB2 document is clean with new edits tracked. Any new responses are marked with "6/2".
2. The second document has mainly copy edits. The changes are labelled with yellow highlight and "6-2-20".

Elke

Message

From: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Sent: 5/18/2020 8:19:03 PM
To: McGartland, Al [McGartland.Al@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Dockins, Chris [Dockins.Chris@epa.gov]; Griffiths, Charles [Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov]; Munis, Ken [Munis.Ken@epa.gov]
CC: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process
Attachments: Interagency comments Round 2 NPRM 2060-AU51.docx; EO 12866 BCA 2060-AU51 NPRM-2020_04_03 OMB1Interagency_5.05.20 EPA additional comments.docx

Looping in the NCEE team.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Best,
Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Sent: Monday, May 18, 2020 3:54 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, the agency responses on your first passback are attached. For the agency commenter who provided inline comments, you can find them by looking for the yellow highlights.

Elke

Message

From: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/3/2020 3:44:52 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Thanks! Wasn't sure what was still active with the late-night passbacks.

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 03, 2020 11:43 AM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

The live onedrive version.

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 11:39 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Leif, I have a few very minor edits from my front office, what version would be best for me to incorporate them?

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Tuesday, June 02, 2020 11:09 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

All, please find the passback in the attached.

1. The OMB2 document is clean with new edits tracked. Any new responses are marked with "6/2".
2. The second document has mainly copy edits. The changes are labelled with yellow highlight and "6-2-20".

Elke

Message

From: Raymond, Kelley [Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/3/2020 1:44:29 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]
CC: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Okay. I just got off a roundtable and Ann Campbell reminded me that we are in need of getting a stable copy reviews can begin on in the very near term. Within the next hour, we'll hit only 24hrs out of signature. That kind of review cycle has been very hard on the program in the past, and I want to try to be as helpful as I can. I recognize the pass back came in very late last night though, but do believe it was likely OMB wanting to give us as clean and complete a picture as possible so we could finish quickly.

At this juncture, we'll need to be judicious in our pushing back, if we need to. So if there is something we can't live with, please let me know right away.

Kelley Raymond
 Office of Air and Radiation
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 9:05 AM
To: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>; Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Cc: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Ok, thanks. I just finished incorporating all their edits and comments into the live OneDrive version. There are a few that I know NCEE will have some thoughts on. I will get back to you as soon as I have had a chance to discuss with Al et al.

Thanks,
 Elizabeth

From: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 8:13 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Cc: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Thanks Elizabeth! It definitely does look like they were burning the midnight oil over there. Really appreciate you getting it to me. I've done a review and I see no show stoppers. There are items to chat through maybe, but it looks primarily

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Overall, I see some pretty easy things for us to address this AM, and draw this to completion. They most certainly did an amazing job giving us a cleaner copy to work with! And that should also make this job far easier today. However, if in

others read they see anything they think we need to push back on, I'd like to chat that through, given the timeframe and discussions we've had with them.

I've left my day light so that I can be available as needed. I'm happy to discuss any of the edits, or make any calls over there if we need to talk edits through.

We'll hopefully be well cleared by then, but at 1pm I do have a meeting where I will not be able to step away for 30 minutes.

Kelley Raymond
Office of Air and Radiation
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 6:37 AM
To: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>; Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Cc: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Hi Kelley and John,

Here is the passback that came in late last night. I am just starting to look through it now and will incorporate the new edits and comments into the onedrive version and then we can see what remains to be discussed.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:09 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

All, please find the passback in the attached.

1. The OMB2 document is clean with new edits tracked. Any new responses are marked with "6/2".
2. The second document has mainly copy edits. The changes are labelled with yellow highlight and "6-2-20".

Elke

Message

From: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/3/2020 1:44:25 PM
To: Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
CC: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Yes, my understanding is that everyone wants this to be finalized as early today as possible.

From: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 3, 2020 9:42 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Thanks for the update. It sounds like we expect to send the passback today, perhaps as early as this morning. I'm assuming that this would be the final, complete, and clean passback that would address all comments received with hopes for clearance today. Please let me know if that is not the plan.

Amy Lamson
Policy and Regulatory Analysis Division, Office of Policy
U.S. EPA
202-564-3949

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, June 03, 2020 9:38 AM
To: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Cc: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

Hi Amy- I have incorporated all of last night's omb edits and comments into the live OneDrive version. Many are fine but I think NCEE will have thoughts on at least a few. I'm due to talk with the NCEE team at 10am, so I can give you another update after that.

Sorry this is all taking so long. As you know so much of this process has been outside of all of our control, and we are all just trying to deal with each round as quickly as we can.

Best,
Elizabeth

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 3, 2020, at 9:16 AM, Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov> wrote:

Please let me know how long you think it will take you to address these comments and send a passback.

Amy Lamson

Policy and Regulatory Analysis Division, Office of Policy
U.S. EPA
202-564-3949

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Tuesday, June 02, 2020 11:09 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 draft deliberative 2060-AU51

All, please find the passback in the attached.

1. The OMB2 document is clean with new edits tracked. Any new responses are marked with "6/2".
2. The second document has mainly copy edits. The changes are labelled with yellow highlight and "6-2-20".

Elke

Message

From: Campbell, Ann [Campbell.Ann@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/3/2020 12:52:16 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]; Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: staff BCA check in

Let me know how I can help.

Ann Campbell
 Chief of Staff
 EPA/Office of Air and Radiation
 Office: 202 566 1370

From: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 4:57 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Cc: Campbell, Ann <Campbell.Ann@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: staff BCA check in

Certainly not as early as I had been lead to believe, and not the most convenient timing. I'm on a call now till 5:30, and have to follow up with Anne following. I'm around at whatever point we do receive, and I can give you a call when I get off the one with Anne if you want, or can reach back out in the AM if preferred.

Adding Ann Campbell for awareness on timing issues.

Kelley Raymond
 Office of Air and Radiation
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 4:38 PM
To: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>; Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: staff BCA check in

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 4:37 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: staff BCA check in

Hi Leif, probably later tonight is my guess. I don't think we'll finish before 6.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 4:28 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED]>
Subject: RE: staff BCA check in

Elke – When should we expect the latest OMB passback?
I want to make sure folks are set on our side to move quickly.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

-----Original Appointment-----

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy \(PP\)](#)>

Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 2:20 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif; Kopits, Elizabeth; Conrad, Daniel; Lamson, Amy; Marten, Alex; McGartland, Al; Kymn, Christine J. EOP/OMB; Thomas, Amanda L. EOP/OMB; Schwab, Margo EOP/OMB; Kluever, April N. EOP/OMB; Mancini, Dominic J. EOP/OMB

Cc: Wolfson, Steve; Raymond, Kelley

Subject: Canceled: staff BCA check in

When: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 3:00 PM-4:00 PM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).

Where: [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy \(PP\)](#)

Importance: High

Message

From: Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/1/2020 8:54:45 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

And I think there should be matching "flags" in comment bubbles in the two documents for the start and end of the cut and paste that need to occur without overwriting anything. There was a little too much in the RA document, like the cost section, which shouldn't be pasted over.

—

Alex Marten
 email: marten.alex@epa.gov
 phone: 202-566-2301

On Jun 1, 2020, at 4:49 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

OK, thank you for cleaning this up. The RA document on OneDrive still has people in it (like Dan C.) so I'm going to let them continue to review before I kick everyone off so that I can copy and paste it in to the ANON version that you attached.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 4:35 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Hi Leif and Alex,

Sorry it took me so long. Attached is a cleaner version of what Leif sent to Elke below (at 1:18pm). (The version that ends with "ANON" has been anonymized already.) I tried to flag very clearly where the other RA etc section would be inserted (where it begins and ends). There are still a few outstanding issues in the other parts, but hopefully it will be enough for OMB for now.

You may want to scroll through it quickly before sending in case I forgot to accept something obvious.

Best,
 Elizabeth

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) >]; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) >
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) >; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) >
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/1/2020 8:35:23 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3
Attachments: 2060-AU51 NPRM 06 01 2020 EPA1_cleaner_ANON.docx; 2060-AU51 NPRM 06 01 2020 EPA1_cleaner.docx

Hi Leif and Alex,

Sorry it took me so long. Attached is a cleaner version of what Leif sent to Elke below (at 1:18pm). (The version that ends with "ANON" has been anonymized already.) I tried to flag very clearly where the other RA etc section would be inserted (where it begins and ends). There are still a few outstanding issues in the other parts, but hopefully it will be enough for OMB for now.

You may want to scroll through it quickly before sending in case I forgot to accept something obvious.

Best,
 Elizabeth

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.HodsonMarten@omb.eop.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)> Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.HodsonMarten@omb.eop.gov>
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)> wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 4/23/2020 2:45:00 PM
To: Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Yes, there was a call with OMB later in the afternoon yesterday. The conversation is mostly captured in the comment bubbles they sent us in the passback file. I guess they wanted to talk through the items they were flagging though we weren't able to discuss everything (call ran long but not long enough it seems).

From: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 10:42 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Great, thanks Leif!

Note I did listen in to the Interagency briefing and seemed to go very well, Did you also connect with OMB later in the PM? I still need to scan comments that you relayed, but am having connection issues at present so just hoping I don't have to road trip in to resolve. ☐

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 23, 2020, at 10:13 AM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Thanks,
Leif

From: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 10:01 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM

Thanks Leif. Just to note that Kelley was very positive at Roundtable on the OMB discussion, your and team's work, and also seemed optimistic about comments, helpful and specific feedback.

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 23, 2020, at 8:59 AM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

FYI

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB {**Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**}
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 8:52 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM

All, please find an initial passback in the attached. This is a partial passback that does not include interagency comments or even all EOP comments, but hopefully will help get things started. You should see some of the topics mentioned yesterday reflected in this passback as well as placeholders.

Please feel free to reach out with any questions. I expect that the next passback will be next week.

Best, Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

{**Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**}
{**Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**}

<EO 12866 BCA 2060-AU51 NPRM-2020_04_03 OMB1.docx>

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 4/23/2020 1:56:51 PM
To: Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"
Attachments: EO 12866 BCA 2060-AU51 NPRM-2020_04_03 OMB1.docx

FYI – OIRA is also trying to schedule a call with DOJ next week.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 8:52 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

All, please find an initial passback in the attached. This is a partial passback that does not include interagency comments or even all EOP comments, but hopefully will help get things started. You should see some of the topics mentioned yesterday reflected in this passback as well as placeholders.

Please feel free to reach out with any questions. I expect that the next passback will be next week.

Best, Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
 Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
 Office of Management and Budget

[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 6/1/2020 6:47:09 PM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Yes, the risk assessment section came over sooner than I thought. I agree that we will want to clean it up a little more if it's going to EOP and will be part of the docket.

I will send a note back to Elke then Google how to remove comment names from Word documents.

Thanks.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:39 PM
To: Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Cc: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Yes let's tell Elke to hold off because we sent the messy version. And then let's remove a few more Comment bubbles and anonymize the remainder.
Happy to talk if helpful.

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 1, 2020, at 2:32 PM, Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov> wrote:

Looks like there are a lot of internal comment bubbles in this version and it has not been anonymized. We should remove the internal comment bubbles before sending back with the risk assessment section incorporated. Not sure if this version will now have to become part of the docket anyway.

--

Alex Marten
phone: (202) 566-2301
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 01, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA's responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week's batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to this [REDACTED] Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
<[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)> wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 4/28/2020 3:09:18 PM
To: Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: BCA rule interagency comments
Attachments: EO 12866 BCA 2060-AU51 Interagency comments long form.docx; EO 12866 BCA 2060-AU51 NPRM-2020_04_03 Interagency comments 04272020.docx

Here's what came in last night.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Monday, April 27, 2020 8:21 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: BCA rule interagency comments

All,

The interagency comments are attached. You have [REDACTED] Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Best, Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 5/21/2020 5:13:39 PM
To: Langdon, Robin [Langdon.Robin@epa.gov]; Weatherhead, Darryl [Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov]; Fann, Neal [Fann.Neal@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process
Attachments: EO 12866 Interagency Comments BCA NPRM RIN 2060-AU51_05.15.20 EPA1.docx

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Friday, May 15, 2020 6:10 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)> Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Cc: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Elke –

Attached are EPA's initial responses to comments out of the most recent passback along with our further considerations after the OMB-EPA call earlier this week.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Additionally there are still a few items which EPA is working through and OGC is still working to respond to DOJ comments. We think next week if we can have the detailed discussion on the risk assessment section and allow further internal deliberations on DOJ feedback we will be able to move closer to addressing all comments. The rule text still has comments but we are waiting to confirm the preamble edits before turning to address those.

Have a nice weekend and I will be in touch early next week.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA

Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)>

Sent: Thursday, May 7, 2020 9:49 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, attached please find what can be considered largely a response to your earlier passback this week. We may have a few additional thoughts as we review your passback but this is comprehensive. We would like to schedule a call as soon as feasible to discuss.

Best, Elke

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 6/2/2020 7:52:46 PM
To: Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Sorry, I heard from Kelley Raymond that she spoke with OMB and they said they would send the pass back soon. And they didn't feel a need for a call to discuss further.

I haven't seen anything yet from Elke.

From: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 3:36 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Have you heard when/whether Elke intends to reschedule the meeting?

Amy Lamson
 Policy and Regulatory Analysis Division, Office of Policy
 U.S. EPA
 202-564-3949

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Tuesday, June 02, 2020 1:42 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Leif, I see your political appointee accepted. If EPA was planning on doing a mixed policy and staff call, I would need to reschedule to include ours as well. Thanks.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:11 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Yes, we can do a staff call at 3pm. Thanks.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:01 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Could you do a staff call at 3 today?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:35 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document (“...EPA-2”) with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)> wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 4/27/2020 9:17:26 PM
To: Landeene, Sarah [Landeene.Sarah@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

OK, thanks.

From: Landeene, Sarah <Landeene.Sarah@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 27, 2020 4:50 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Thank you, Leif. I will have a calendar invite with dial-in sent for 10am.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 27, 2020 4:33 PM
To: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>; Landeene, Sarah <Landeene.Sarah@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Kelley – Can we meet at 10am tomorrow? Thanks.

From: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 27, 2020 3:33 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>; Landeene, Sarah <Landeene.Sarah@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Leif-

Checking back on this – think we could connect tomorrow AM to talk about where we are on the OIRA feedback? I had a couple ideas to offer as well, and Brittany flagged one thing for me. I could make any AM time tomorrow work that's convenient for you.

Kelley Raymond
 Office of Air and Radiation
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

From: Raymond, Kelley
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 9:22 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Thanks Leif! I know you and Elizabeth and Dan are probably chatting soon to discuss. I think prioritizing edits where they were specific is likely the best place to focus, and offering feedback or questions as needed. Know that the faster we return our passback, I know the faster we get to our next set of comments. So If we can internally set a god timeline for getting them feedback on their redline and bubbles I think that will help us keep the process moving along!

I'm here if you have questions or need anything-

Kelley Raymond
Office of Air and Radiation
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 9:00 AM
To: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

FYI

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.Hodson@eop-omb.eop.gov> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 8:52 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

All, please find an initial passback in the attached. This is a partial passback that does not include interagency comments or even all EOP comments, but hopefully will help get things started. You should see some of the topics mentioned yesterday reflected in this passback as well as placeholders.

Please feel free to reach out with any questions. I expect that the next passback will be next week.

Best, Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 5/26/2020 10:07:31 PM
To: Thomas, Amanda L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 NPRM passback--batch 1

OK, I see comments with green highlights in IV B and new preamble text in the risk assessment/Choosing Health Endpoints and Quantification section.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Thomas, Amanda L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Tuesday, May 26, 2020 5:47 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 NPRM passback--batch 1

Please look at highlighted comment bubbles.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, May 26, 2020 5:41 PM
To: Thomas, Amanda L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 NPRM passback--batch 1

Amanda –

Thank you for sending this first batch of passbacks. The comment bubbles are all anonymized now in the document so I cannot quite tell which are new comments from OMB versus response comments from EPA (e.g., listed as “Kopits, Elizabeth” in previous versions).

Is there a particular section of the proposal in this batch 1 passback file that we should turn our attention to?

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)

OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Thomas, Amanda L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>
Sent: Tuesday, May 26, 2020 5:18 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: 2060-AU51 NPRM passback--batch 1

Please find attached the first batch of the passbacks. Will be second a second batch tonight. There may be a 3rd batch tomorrow.

Thanks for your patience. Amanda

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 5/8/2020 9:19:48 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Sorry, flurry of emails to end Friday. I did speak with Elke and she is interested in setting up staff level call on Tuesday (probably afternoon). She will send some possible times for Tuesday on Monday.

We thought we could try to aim for a higher level discussion with OMB on their big ticket items, versus a comment by comment ticking through our responses. Though it might be a chance for us to highlight our initial responses for them to better understand where we're coming from.

We'll talk more on Monday.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 4:14 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

I combined the comment response document we sent back earlier this week with the latest set of OMB comments. Unfortunately when combining you still get the generic, anonymous "Author" for all OMB comments but the old ones should have responses from Elizabeth while the new comments don't have any responses.

I still think the easiest and most straight-forward approach would be to take the latest document from Elke and respond in that document alone to its comments. Looking at the two sets of comments I don't think they overlap so that our previous response answers the newer comment. If we track the new comments document alone it would be a cleaner way to review our responses.

I think after we work through the second round of comments I can combine the two response documents and then we can double-check our responses and text changes to keep straight what we are sending back to OMB. Again we'll see on Monday (or this evening) what times Elke proposes for our call and what she might provide for that.

We can discuss more on Monday morning. Have a good weekend and stay safe.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 9:20 AM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Yes, these comments are on the original proposal and include a considerable overlay on top of the comments we already responded to.

I assume that Elke won't schedule their follow-up until maybe Monday afternoon. Do we want to take today to review these and think about them and then the 3 of us have our usual Monday morning call to discuss? I'm not sure we'd have answers for OMB on Monday but at least we can all talk through how we want to approach and timing for the subsequent EPA responses.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 8:03 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

I see you had the same reaction I did, I'm available for most of today until 2:00 but won't be able to have digested these comments in full and have any fleshed out response so it would mostly be to have them talking to us, not sure on other's availability or who else should be on.

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 08, 2020 6:38 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Hi Elke,

Can you clarify what you meant by this being a response to our passback? I'm not seeing the earlier comments or any edits/comments made in response in this version. As for a call, today I can be available 9-9:45am or 11:30am-3pm. I will check who else from OP would wish to attend and let you all know their availability as soon as I can.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, May 7, 2020 9:49 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, attached please find what can be considered largely a response to your earlier passback this week. We may have a few additional thoughts as we review your passback but this is comprehensive. We would like to schedule a call as soon as feasible to discuss.

Best, Elke

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 5/8/2020 8:14:10 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process
Attachments: EO 12866 BCA 2060-AU51 NPRM-2020_04_03 OMB1Interagency_5.05.20 EPA+OMB-0507.docx

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

We can discuss more on Monday morning. Have a good weekend and stay safe.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 9:20 AM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Yes, these comments are on the original proposal and include a considerable overlay on top of the comments we already responded to.

I assume that Elke won't schedule their follow-up until maybe Monday afternoon. Do we want to take today to review these and think about them and then the 3 of us have our usual Monday morning call to discuss? I'm not sure we'd have answers for OMB on Monday but at least we can all talk through how we want to approach and timing for the subsequent EPA responses.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 8, 2020 8:03 AM
To: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

I see you had the same reaction I did, I'm available for most of today until 2:00 but won't be able to have digested these comments in full and have any fleshed out response so it would mostly be to have them talking to us, not sure on other's availability or who else should be on.

Daniel H. Conrad
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of General Counsel
Air and Radiation Law Office
(202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Sent: Friday, May 08, 2020 6:38 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]> Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Hi Elke,

Can you clarify what you meant by this being a response to our passback? I'm not seeing the earlier comments or any edits/comments made in response in this version. As for a call, today I can be available 9-9:45am or 11:30am-3pm. I will check who else from OP would wish to attend and let you all know their availability as soon as I can.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]>
Sent: Thursday, May 7, 2020 9:49 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 Review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, attached please find what can be considered largely a response to your earlier passback this week. We may have a few additional thoughts as we review your passback but this is comprehensive. We would like to schedule a call as soon as feasible to discuss.

Best, Elke

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 6/2/2020 6:34:54 PM
To: Dockins, Chris [Dockins.Chris@epa.gov]; Griffiths, Charles [Griffiths.Charles@epa.gov]; Weatherhead, Darryl [Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov]; Chan, Elizabeth [Chan.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Langdon, Robin [Langdon.Robin@epa.gov]; Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]; Wolfson, Steve [Wolfson.Steve@epa.gov]; Munis, Ken [Munis.Ken@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex [Marten.Alex@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: OMB 3pm call canceled

From: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 2:22 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

I've spoken with OMB – you should be getting their pass back shortly. They feel it will be sufficient, and a call will not be needed.

Please forward to the broader list from the earlier chain when it comes in, and I'm here if anyone wants to chat it through.

Kelley Raymond
Office of Air and Radiation
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 1:49 PM
To: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Kelley – I am still waiting for an update from OMB on what they wanted to discuss at today's 3pm call. But they were organizing it as a staff-level call.

See Elke's note below about how OIRA might now need to coordinate. I'm not sure if this would change the timing from 3pm.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 1:42 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Leif, I see your political appointee accepted. If EPA was planning on doing a mixed policy and staff call, I would need to reschedule to include ours as well. Thanks.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:11 AM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB { **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** } Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Yes, we can do a staff call at 3pm. Thanks.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB { **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** }
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 11:01 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Could you do a staff call at 3 today?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:35 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB { **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** } Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document (“...EPA-2”) with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 6/2/2020 12:50:21 AM
To: Raymond, Kelley [Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov]
CC: Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3
Attachments: 2060-AU51 NPRM 06 01 2020 EPA-2.docx

Kelley – Here is the complete comment response and revised text document that I just sent back to OMB. As I indicated to Elke, we can make ourselves available tomorrow to talk through any parts of our responses and text.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:35 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document (“...EPA-2”) with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B

1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) [REDACTED]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Elke.L.HodsonMarten@omb.eop.gov>
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <**Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**> wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov]
Sent: 6/4/2020 12:37:18 PM
To: Raymond, Kelley [Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov]
CC: Woods, Andrea [Woods.Andrea@epa.gov]; Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]; DeLuca, Isabel [DeLuca.Isabel@epa.gov]
Subject: Re: technical backups

I think it may be too late for the briefing materials, but please also add Darryl Weatherhead in OAQPS as a technical backup for Thursday's 11:00AM call with stakeholders. Thanks.

On Jun 2, 2020, at 7:40 PM, Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov> wrote:

Absolutely!

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 2, 2020, at 6:16 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Please also add Robin Langdon in OAQPS as technical backup for Wednesday's 4pm call and Thursday's 11:30am call. Thanks.

From: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 1:21 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Woods, Andrea <Woods.Andrea@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>; DeLuca, Isabel <DeLuca.Isabel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: technical backups

Thank you Leif! Adding Andrea from OPA who can include that for the Administrator on the materials. I will forward the invites. When you get an additional name from OAQPS please let me know.

Kelley Raymond
Office of Air and Radiation
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, June 2, 2020 1:06 PM
To: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: technical backups

Kelley –

You can include Elizabeth Kopits as a technical backup for all the meetings, the one tomorrow at 4pm and then the two calls on Thursday.

You can list me also for the two calls on Thursday.

I'm still waiting to hear back from others in OP and OAQPS about their availability but at least Elizabeth offers great backup.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Raymond, Kelley <Raymond.Kelley@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:54 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Shoaff, John <Shoaff.John@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thank you Leif! Did you all discuss and decide who should do the technical backup for the various rollout calls on the 3rd and 4th? I've had a couple pings from OCIR and OPA as they would like to include the names in the Administrator's briefing materials.

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 1, 2020, at 8:50 PM, Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov> wrote:

Kelley – Here is the complete comment response and revised text document that I just sent back to OMB. As I indicated to Elke, we can make ourselves available tomorrow to talk through any parts of our responses and text.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460
 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 8:35 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
 < **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** Kopits, Elizabeth
 <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex
 <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke –

Thank you for your patience. Please find attached a complete document (“...EPA-2”) with all the EPA responses to comments and also revised sections in response to Batch 1 text edits. The new EPA text for these sections is indicated with comment bubbles with red, bold text. This may be distributed to EOP.

We worked on the reg text to be consistent with our new preamble sections but we still need to go back and clean up the formatting and numbering. Please let me know if you have any questions and we can make ourselves available tomorrow for a conference call to discuss further. Just let me know what your schedule looks like.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460
| USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
{ **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** }; Kopits, Elizabeth
<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex
<Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
{ **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** }
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth
<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex

<Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>

Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM

To: Hodson,Marten,Elke L. EOP/OMB

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP); Kopits, Elizabeth

<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex

<Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP

OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)

OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B

1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460

| USA

Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

< **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** >

Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth

<Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>

Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L.
EOP/OMB < **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** >
wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and
blue highlights for new comments. New edits are
shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

<2060-AU51 NPRM 06 01 2020 EPA-2.docx>

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 5/6/2020 1:12:33 PM
To: Lamson, Amy [Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Amy – Yes, this has been a continuing area of confusion for me. I'll keep asking the team and remind them that these knowingly incorrect citations need to be clarified and fixed.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, May 5, 2020 5:33 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Hi, Leif.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Amy Lamson
 Policy and Regulatory Analysis Division, Office of Policy
 U.S. EPA
 202-564-3949

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, May 05, 2020 2:40 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) > Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Cc: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Elke –

Attached are EPA's responses and proposed edits from the OMB comments in the April 23 passback. The document also includes responses to interagency comments as sent by OMB on April 27.

Please let me know if it would be convenient to set up a time to review the responses this week and also to discuss further OMB comments that you all might be working on.

Thanks,
Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 8:52 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

All, please find an initial passback in the attached. This is a partial passback that does not include interagency comments or even all EOP comments, but hopefully will help get things started. You should see some of the topics mentioned yesterday reflected in this passback as well as placeholders.

Please feel free to reach out with any questions. I expect that the next passback will be next week.

Best, Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget
[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) b7
[REDACTED] Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 5/6/2020 12:30:20 PM
To: Shoaff, John [Shoaff.John@epa.gov]
Subject: FW: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

FYI

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)]>
Sent: Tuesday, May 5, 2020 9:56 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Cc: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Thanks, Leif. I'll get back to you on the offer of a call. I hope to send you the remaining EOP comments in the next day or two.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, May 5, 2020 2:40 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)]>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Cc: Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM"

Elke –

Attached are EPA's responses and proposed edits from the OMB comments in the April 23 passback. The document also includes responses to interagency comments as sent by OMB on April 27.

Please let me know if it would be convenient to set up a time to review the responses this week and also to discuss further OMB comments that you all might be working on.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <[Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)]>
Sent: Thursday, April 23, 2020 8:52 AM

To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>

Subject: EO 12866 Deliberative Review: EPA's "Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process NPRM

All, please find an initial passback in the attached. This is a partial passback that does not include interagency comments or even all EOP comments, but hopefully will help get things started. You should see some of the topics mentioned yesterday reflected in this passback as well as placeholders.

Please feel free to reach out with any questions. I expect that the next passback will be next week.

Best, Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 5/18/2020 9:27:03 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
CC: Kopits, Elizabeth [Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

Yes, I'm going to ask Elke to help on version control and also nudge her when there might be staff+policy call on the risk assessment section. I agree that it doesn't make sense to respond to the second round of interagency comments before we hear back from OMB on our response to both their passback comments.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, May 18, 2020 4:31 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

So we now have responses to our first comments that don't include our second response. Can we recommend that they give us responses to both since Elizabeth went to the trouble of folding in the first with the second. Otherwise we are just playing a temporal game where we are responding to comments on an older version without knowing if our current version resolved any concerns.

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Monday, May 18, 2020 3:54 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>; Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Interagency comments for EO 12866 review: NPRM: Increasing Consistency and Transparency in Considering Benefits and Costs in the Clean Air Act Rulemaking Process

All, the agency responses on your first passback are attached. For the agency commenter who provided inline comments, you can find them by looking for the yellow highlights.

Elke

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 6/1/2020 7:04:28 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

ASAP, I guess? They are aiming to have the package signed on Thursday.

There still seems to be a lot of moving pieces right now.

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 3:01 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

What's the intended timing on sending the new section back?

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 01, 2020 2:50 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please hold off for now. Our additional revised section on risk assessment came in quicker than I thought it would and in an ideal world I can send you one file that has everything that you can then distribute to EOP.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 2:25 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Thanks, Leif. Just checking if this is ready to circulate within EOP? Or should I wait until the risk assessment section is done?

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, June 1, 2020 1:18 PM
To: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Hodson.Marten.Elke@epa.gov> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>; Marten, Alex <Marten.Alex@epa.gov>; Lamson, Amy <Lamson.Amy@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Elke – Please find attached EPA’s responses and revised text out of the earlier OMB comments as well as last week’s batches of comments.

Please note that we are still addressing new OMB text on the “use of risk assessment information” section. We appreciate the text provided by OMB but have redrafted some of it for OMB’s additional consideration. That will be sent later today so note that this part of the attached proposal still is marked up and needs to be cleaned up. And we also note that the reg text will need to be cleaned up to match the new, settled preamble text.

We will send a note later today on this section but please let me know if you have any questions on this document with all other sections for your consideration.

Thanks,
 Leif

DRAFT/DELIBERATIVE NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative or draft information and materials.

LEIF HOCKSTAD | LEADER, POLICY SUPPORT GROUP
 OFFICE OF AIR POLICY & PROGRAM SUPPORT (OAPPS)
 OFFICE OF AIR & RADIATION | U.S. EPA | WJC NORTH 5442B
 1200 PENNSYLVANIA AVE. NW | MC 6103A | WASHINGTON, D.C. | 20460 | USA
Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov | 1-202-343-9432

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Hodson.Marten.Elke@epa.gov> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)**
Sent: Thursday, May 28, 2020 7:03 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>; Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Cc: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: 2060-AU51 passback--Batch 3

Also let us know if you want a staff call this week (tomorrow) on this passback, which includes responses to the additional presentation section.

On May 28, 2020, at 6:03 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB <Hodson.Marten.Elke@epa.gov> **Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)** wrote:

All, see attached for batch 3. Search for “5/28” and blue highlights for new comments. New edits are shown in tracked changes on top of a clean batch 1.

Best, Elke

<2060-AU51 NPRM 05 28 2020 batch 1 batch3.docx>

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 4/21/2020 8:02:39 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

OK, thanks.

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 3:58 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Looks fine to me

Daniel H. Conrad
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of General Counsel
Air and Radiation Law Office
(202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 3:25 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

I am still clearing with OAR IO but here is something that NCEE drafted up earlier (for ANPRM) and also for their meeting last week. Minor tweaks but note of appreciation to Elizabeth. I liked keeping these short and sweet.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 2:51 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

I'm not sure what protocol is there but happy to take a look.

Daniel H. Conrad
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of General Counsel
Air and Radiation Law Office
(202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 2:38 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

And one more thing: OMB is requesting some materials for tomorrow's meeting. I am running things by the OAR IO but do I also need to pass them to you all in OGC for review before sending them over?

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 12:44 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Yes, I think that should be fine. Amy Lamson will also attend in addition to Elizabeth.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 11:13 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Ok to add steve Wolfson to the omb call?

Daniel H. Conrad
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of General Counsel
Air and Radiation Law Office
(202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 1:35 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

OK, I will keep that in mind when trying to work out some times with OMB.

Ex. 5 Attorney Client (AC)

Thanks,
Leif

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 10:28 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Thanks Leif, I have calls from 9:00-5:00 on Tuesday (what?!?) but am free most of Wednesday morning.

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 10:17 AM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: BC CAA rule

Dan – I passed this note to Kelley to see how she might want our OMB briefing to be organized. But I wanted to check on your availability as I would envision any conversation with OMB including both you and Elizabeth.

I will let you know when I heard something back but pass me a note on how your midweek schedule looks this week. Hope you are doing well.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB { Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)
Sent: Friday, April 17, 2020 8:36 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: BC CAA rule

Thanks, Elizabeth! I usually try to cc a few folks when we pass things back and forth so I'll keep both of you looped.

Leif, we'd like to set up an interagency briefing on the BCA rule. I can send the invite. What times is EPA available? Can we do earlier in the week like Tuesday or Wednesday?

Also, any chance you have a summary of the public comments for the ANPRM?

Elke

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:48 PM, Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Elke,
 I'm happy to help but the official workgroup lead is Leif Hockstad in OAR. I'm cc'ing him above because I don't know what the correct protocol is. I'm the main person on the rule in office of policy.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:24 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP) wrote:

Elizabeth, are you the rule lead for the BCA rule? Mary Manibusan pointed me your way. We would like to set up an interagency briefing for next week. Are you the right person to help me organize that?

Thanks!
Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Message

From: Hockstad, Leif [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=5A4FB1F8930645EFA34FDFA7485BC6DA-LHOCKSTA]
Sent: 4/21/2020 7:24:57 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel [conrad.daniel@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule
Attachments: BC NPRM_1 pager overview for NCEE_short-OAR.docx; ANPRM_overview of public comments_OP-vOAR.docx

I am still clearing with OAR IO but here is something that NCEE drafted up earlier (for ANPRM) and also for their meeting last week. Minor tweaks but note of appreciation to Elizabeth. I liked keeping these short and sweet.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 2:51 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

I'm not sure what protocol is there but happy to take a look.

Daniel H. Conrad
 U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
 Office of General Counsel
 Air and Radiation Law Office
 (202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 2:38 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

And one more thing: OMB is requesting some materials for tomorrow's meeting. I am running things by the OAR IO but do I also need to pass them to you all in OGC for review before sending them over?

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Hockstad, Leif
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 12:44 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Yes, I think that should be fine. Amy Lamson will also attend in addition to Elizabeth.

Thanks,
 Leif

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, April 21, 2020 11:13 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Ok to add steve Wolfson to the omb call?

Daniel H. Conrad
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of General Counsel
Air and Radiation Law Office
(202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 1:35 PM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

OK, I will keep that in mind when trying to work out some times with OMB.

Ex. 5 Attorney Client (AC)

Thanks,
Leif

From: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 10:28 AM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: BC CAA rule

Thanks Leif, I have calls from 9:00-5:00 on Tuesday (what?!?) but am free most of Wednesday morning.

Daniel H. Conrad
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Office of General Counsel
Air and Radiation Law Office
(202) 564-0903

CONFIDENTIALITY NOTICE: This message may contain deliberative, attorney-client, or otherwise privileged material. Do not release this message under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, please contact the sender and delete all copies.

From: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Sent: Monday, April 20, 2020 10:17 AM
To: Conrad, Daniel <conrad.daniel@epa.gov>
Subject: FW: BC CAA rule

Dan – I passed this note to Kelley to see how she might want our OMB briefing to be organized. But I wanted to check on your availability as I would envision any conversation with OMB including both you and Elizabeth.

I will let you know when I heard something back but pass me a note on how your midweek schedule looks this week. Hope you are doing well.

Thanks,
Leif

From: Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB [Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]
Sent: Friday, April 17, 2020 8:36 PM
To: Hockstad, Leif <Hockstad.Leif@epa.gov>
Cc: Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: BC CAA rule

Thanks, Elizabeth! I usually try to cc a few folks when we pass things back and forth so I'll keep both of you looped.

Leif, we'd like to set up an interagency briefing on the BCA rule. I can send the invite. What times is EPA available? Can we do earlier in the week like Tuesday or Wednesday?

Also, any chance you have a summary of the public comments for the ANPRM?

Elke

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:48 PM, Kopits, Elizabeth <Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Elke,
I'm happy to help but the official workgroup lead is Leif Hockstad in OAR. I'm cc'ing him above because I don't know what the correct protocol is. I'm the main person on the rule in office of policy.

Thanks,
Elizabeth

Sent from my iPhone

On Apr 17, 2020, at 5:24 PM, Hodson Marten, Elke L. EOP/OMB
<[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]> wrote:

Elizabeth, are you the rule lead for the BCA rule? Mary Manibusan pointed me your way. We would like to set up an interagency briefing for next week. Are you the right person to help me organize that?

Thanks!
Elke

Elke Hodson, Ph.D.
Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs
Office of Management and Budget
[Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)]

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)